## IAI SPECIAL EDITION

#### **RESEARCH ARTICLE**



# Development of novel curcumin nanoemulgel: Optimisation, characterisation, and *ex vivo* permeation

Ferdy Firmansyah<sup>1</sup>, Wildan Khairi Muhtadi<sup>1</sup>, Sepfira Indriani<sup>1</sup>, Maulana Dziya Ulhaq<sup>1</sup>, Suci Rizki Auliya<sup>1</sup>, Benni Iskandar<sup>1</sup>, Nesa Agistia<sup>1</sup>, Lutfi Chabib<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Farmasi (STIFAR) Riau, Tampan, Pekanbaru, Riau, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup> Department of Pharmacy, Islamic University of Indonesia, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

#### Keywords

Curcumin Nanoemulsions Nanoemulgels Permeation

#### Correspondence

Wildan Khairi Muhtadi Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Farmasi (STIFAR) Riau Tampan Pekanbaru Riau Indonesia muhtadiwildan@gmail.com

#### Abstract

**Introduction:** Curcumin (Crc) is widely used as an antioxidant and an anti-inflammatory agent. Its low solubility limits its oral bioavailability, thus the need to develop a transdermal nanoformulation of Crc. **Aim:** This study aimed to obtain the stable formula of Crc-loaded nanoemulgels (Crc-NEGs) possessing good characteristics. **Methods:** The nanoemulsion (NE) was prepared by titration of the water phase into the mixture of oil, surfactant, and cosurfactant. Crc-NEs optimum formula was obtained by the simplex lattice design (SLD) method. Crc-NEGs were prepared using Carbopol 940 as the gelling agent, and subsequently, its freeze-thaw stability was observed. The *ex vivo* permeation study of Crc-NEGs was conducted using Franz diffusion cell. **Results:** The optimum formula of Crc-NEs showed good characteristics in terms of transmittance, particle size, polydispersity index, and zeta potential. Crc-NEGs were found stable through freeze-thaw stability. The *ex vivo* permeation study illustrated the higher amount of Crc penetrated from NEGs compared to the control (*p* <0,05). **Conclusion:** The Crc-NEGs formula has the potential to be the novel effective delivery method of curcumin.

#### Introduction

Curcumin (Crc) is a compound isolated from the rhizome of *Curcuma longa* Linn possessing antioxidant, anti-inflammatory, antimicrobial, and anticancer properties (Tønnesen & Karlsen, 1985; Rachmawati *et al.*, 2015; Hewlings & Kalman, 2017). However, curcumin's low water solubility becomes a significant drawback, as this leads to a decrease in bioavailability and lower its efficacy when administered orally (Rachmawati *et al.*, 2015). Hence, to overcome this problem, transdermal delivery is suggested. This route is expected to be a promising solution.

Nanoemulsions (NEs) are one of the beneficial dosage forms for transdermal delivery. Possessing the dispersed particle size of lower than 200 nanometers (nm), NEs are visually clear and thermodynamically stable (Tang *et al.*, 2012; Lala & Awari, 2014). Moreover, the nano-scale particles increase the penetration ability into the deeper skin layers (Su *et al.,* 2017).

A suitable optimisation method is needed to obtain the optimum formula of Crc-loaded NEs (CrcNEs) with sufficient skin penetration. Simplex lattice design (SLD) is a statistical-based method that could be utilised to describe the relations between CrcNEs constituents (e.g., surfactants-cosurfactants mixtures (Smix), oil, and aqueous phase). This method outweighs trial and error, which is an ineffective and time-consuming method (Duangjit *et al.*, 2014).

The transdermal delivery of NEs can be adequately conducted by incorporating these NEs into hydrogel bases to form nanoemulgels (NEGs). Increased adhesion ability generated by a gel system will localise drug penetration and hinder active ingredients from being washed by sweat on the skin surface (Ahmad *et al.*, 2019; Muhtadi *et al.*, 2020). This study aims to develop an effective transdermal delivery of Crc by incorporating it into a nano vehicle. The specific purposes of this study are to observe the characteristics of the nanoformulation and assess its skin penetration ability through *ex vivo* diffusion. To the best of our knowledge, no studies have yet formulated the nano dosage form of Crc through computational optimisation.

#### Materials and methods

#### Materials

Curcumin (Crc) (Merck, Germany); virgin coconut oil (VCO) (PT. Inhil Sarimas Kelapa, Indonesia); tween 80 (TW80) (Kao, Indonesia); transcutol P (TP) (Gattefosse, France); carbopol 940 (C940) (STIFAR Riau, Indonesia); sodium metabisulfite (Zhejiang Medicine, China); ethanol, sodium hydroxide, potassium dihydrogen phosphate (Merck, USA).

#### Solubility study

An excess of Crc was put into four tubes consisting of 5 ml of VCO, TW80, TP, and water, respectively, then stirred for 24 hours and centrifuged at 3000 rpm for 15 minutes. The supernatants were analysed using UV-Vis Spectrophotometer (Shimadzu UV-1800) at 428 nm.

#### Construction of pseudo-ternary phase diagram and Formula optimisation using SLD

TW80:TP (Smix) were mixed in several ratios, VCO was mixed with Smix(s), yielding VCO:Smix(TW80:TP) ratios (Table I), and added with water. Visual behaviour was plotted into the phase diagram (ProSim Ternary Diagram 1.0). CrcNEs' optimisation was conducted using Design-Expert (Stat-Ease Inc., USA). The factors were concentrations of water (X<sub>1</sub>), VCO (X<sub>2</sub>), and Smix (X<sub>3</sub>), and the response was transmittance (Y<sub>1</sub>) (Duangjit *et al.*, 2014).

The Ratio					O	bserved	l appea	rance fo	ollowing	g the ad	dition o	of aqueo	ous pha	se				
of oil:Smix (TW80:TP) (ml)	0 µl	100 μl	100 μl	100 μl	100 μl	100 μl	100 μl	150 μl	200 μl	200 μl	300 μl	0.35 ml	0.5 ml	0.65 ml	1.0 ml	1.5 ml	3.5 ml	1.1 ml
1:9	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	NE	NE	NE	NE
(7.1) 1:9	NE	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	NE	NE	NE	NE
(8:1) 1:9	NE	E	E	E	E	E	E	E	E	Е	E	Е	E	Е	NE	NE	NE	NE
(9:1) 1:7	NE	E	Е	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE								
(7:1) 1:7	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	Е	Е	Е	Е	NE	NE	NE	NE
(8:1) 1:7	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	E	E	E	NE	NE	NE	NE
(9:1) 1:8	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE
(7:1) 1:8	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	E	E	E	NE	NE	NE
(8:1) 1:8 (9:1)	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	NE	Е	E	Е	NE	NE	NE	NE

NE- Nanoemulsions; E- Emulsions

# Preparation, transmittance, and the prediction and verification of Curcumin-loaded nanoemulsion (CrcNES)

Crc (0.25% in the final formula) was added to VCO and stirred at 300 rpm. TW80, TP, and water were sequentially added into the mixture (Duangjit *et al.*, 2014; Muhtadi *et al.*, 2019). The transmittance of CrcNEs was analysed using a UV-Vis spectrophotometer (Shimadzu UV-1800) at 650 nm with water as the blank (Syukri *et al.*, 2018). The prediction of the optimum CrcNEs was examined by assessing several relevant values of  $Y_1$  in Design-Expert software. Moreover, the verification of the optimum condition was assessed by a one-

sample t-test with a confidence interval of 95% (*p*>0.05) (Shiyan *et al.,* 2018).

#### Particle size, polydispersity index, and zeta potential

Studies were carried out using a particle size analyser (Horiba SZ-100). One millilitre of the sample was put into a flask and was diluted with 25 ml of distilled water and analysed in triplicate.

Preparation of Curcumin-loaded nanoemulgel Crc-NEGs and freeze-thaw stability study C940 (0.4 g) was sprinkled on the surface of Crc-NE and stirred (300 rpm) at a warm temperature. Moreover, sodium metabisulfite was added and stirred until the homogenous gel was formed (Muhtadi *et al.*, 2020). Furthermore, CrcNEGs were stored at 4°C for 48 hours and 40°C for 48 hours (1 cycle), with a total of 6 cycles. The phase separation, pH (Ohaus ST300), viscosity (Brookfield DV-1 Ametek), and spreadability were observed (Donsì *et al.*, 2011).

#### Ex vivo skin permeation study

The dorsal skin hair of Wistar male mice was trimmed and cut to a circular shape. The excised skin was then immersed in phosphate buffer (PB) pH 7.4 for 30 minutes. CrcNEGs (5 grams) were placed on the donor compartment of the Franz diffusion cell, and the receptor solution (PB pH 7.4) was stirred at  $37\pm0.5^{\circ}$ C and 100 rpm. Aliquots (5 ml) were collected in the span of 8 hours and were measured using a UV-Vis spectrophotometer (Shimadzu UV-1800) at 430 nm. Cumulative Crc permeated ( $\mu$ g/cm<sup>2</sup>), flux ( $\mu$ g/cm<sup>2</sup>.h), and permeability coefficient (cm/h) was calculated from the detected Crc concentration (Kim *et al.*, 2008).

#### Statistical analysis

The results were provided as mean±standard deviation. The effects of factors against response in the SLD were analysed using ANOVA. The optimisation study was verified and analysed using a one-sample *t*-test. *Ex vivo* permeation results were analysed using a two-sample *t*-test.

#### Results

#### Solubility study of Crc

Solubility values of Crc in VCO, TW80, TP, and water were 1.65  $\pm$  140.31 mg/ml, 132,51  $\pm$  3.60 mg/ml, 59.28  $\pm$  11.85 mg/ml, and 0.59 µg/ml, respectively.

#### Pseudo-ternary phase diagram

The VCO:Smix(TW80:TP) ratio of 1:8(7:1) yielded a transparent visuality and was used further in the SLD. Figure 1 illustrates the pseudo-ternary phase diagram.

#### Formula optimisation using SLD

The upper and lower limits of  $X_1$ ,  $X_2$ , and  $X_3$  concentrations were 62-66%, 0-4%, and 30-34%, respectively. The SLD runs are presented in Table II with the  $Y_1$  range of 51.6-93.2%. The several statistical indicators of the SLD are presented in Table II.



Figure 1: The pseudo-ternary phase diagram indicating the area of NEs formation, which was marked by red dots

Table II: Design of optimisation of CrcNEs using SLD and the statistical parameters of the response of transmittance Y<sub>1</sub>

Number	Water	VCO	Smix	Transmittance				
of runs	(%)	(%)	(%)	(%)				
	(X1)	(X <sub>2</sub> )	(X₃)	(Y <sub>1</sub> )				
1	64	4	32	77.1				
2	64	2	34	70				
3	66	0	34	92.2				
4	64	4	32	76.3				
5	62	4	34	68.9				
6	64,67	2.67	32.67	60.1				
7	64	4	32	83.6				
8	64	2	34	72.7				
9	66	2	32	93.2				
10	64	2	34	91				
11	66	2	32	81.8				
12	66	4	30	51.6				
13	66	2	32	91.2				
Param	eters	Values						
Model p	-value	0.045						
Deviation	standard	7.82						
Mea	an	77.67%						
C\	/	10.07%						
R <sup>2</sup>		0.8179						
Adequate	precision	7.072						
<b>Regression equation</b>		Y <sub>1</sub> = 764.63 X <sub>1</sub> + 733.37 X <sub>2</sub> + 643.37 X <sub>3</sub> -						
		2789.60 X <sub>1</sub> X <sub>2</sub> – 2447.20 X <sub>1</sub> X <sub>3</sub> - 2477.87						
		$X_2 X_3$ +5494.40 $X_1 X_2 X_3$						

#### The prediction and verification

The selected concentrations were 4.00% (VCO), 32.47% (Smix(7:1)), and 63.53% (water). Figure 2 presents desirability (0.826) and Y<sub>1</sub> prediction (79.99%), indicating no difference between the predicted and observed Y<sub>1</sub> (p > 0.05).



Figure 2: The 3D-response surface plot of desirability (a) and prediction of transmittance value (b)

#### Particle size, polydispersity index, and zeta potential

The results showed the particle size of lower than 200 nm, polydispersity index of below 0.7, and the zeta potential of higher than -20 mV (Table III).

#### Table III: Results of CrcNEs characterisation (n = 3)

Parameters	Values
Particle size	12.73 ± 0.81 nm
Polydispersity index	$0.325 \pm 0.02$
Zeta potential	-26.6 ± 0.44 mV

#### Freeze-thaw stability of CrcNEGs

The results indicated stable CrcNEGs through freezethaw stability based on several parameters, such as phase separation, pH, viscosity, and spreadability (Table IV).

#### Table IV: Results of freeze-thaw stability of CrcNEGs

Deveneters	Number of cycles									
Parameters	1	2	3	4	5	6				
Phase separation	NP	NP	NP	NP	NP	NP				
рН	4.55	4.58	4.55	4.89	4.95	5.05				
Viscosity (cP)	340 ± 34.64	NM	NM	NM	NM	346.67 ± 42.63				
Spreadability (cm <sup>2</sup> )	188.59	186.17	188.59	188.59	186.17	186.17				

NP = No phase separation; NM = Not measured

#### Ex vivo skin permeation

The cumulative Crc permeated for eight hours from the NEGs (25.16±14.20  $\mu$ g/cm<sup>2</sup>) was higher than the control (16.57±3.54  $\mu$ g/cm<sup>2</sup>) (Figure 3). The flux of CrcNEGs (2.46±2.19  $\mu$ g/cm<sup>2</sup>.h) was higher compared to the plain Crc (1.92±0.56  $\mu$ g/cm<sup>2</sup>.h), with *p* > 0.05.



Figure 3: Cumulative of Crc permeated (n = 3)

#### Discussion

The solubility study illustrated that Crc was loaded into the oil droplets, as the manufactured NEs were in the state of oil in water (O/W). Preliminary studies had shown equilibrium points that produced a transparent NE from the initial until the last drops of the water phase (Shafiq-un-Nabi *et al.,* 2007). In this study, transparent NEs were produced in each waterdropping point. VCO:Smix(TW80:TP) of 1:8(7:1) was selected for further optimisation as it had lower surfactant compared to the VCO:Smix ratio of 1:9 because the higher concentration of surfactants potentially ignites skin irritation (Effendy & Maibach, 1995).

The used factors had significant effects on the NEs' transmittance. It was clear that each factor had a positive effect or merely increased the transmittance values. Conversely, the absence of one of the factors decreased the transmittance of CrcNEs. The value of  $R^2$  of more than 0.7, the adequate precision of higher than 4.0, indicated that the model used for the optimisation of CrcNEs described the correlation of factors and responses (Setyawan *et al.*, 2018; Shiyan *et al.*, 2018).

The desirability value (close to 1) indicated the model's ability to accurately predict the actual transmittance of the optimum formula (Candioti *et al.*, 2014). Transmittance reflects the clarity of NEs favoured with values closer to 100% (Laxmi *et al.*, 2015). The formula's visual appearance was not very clear though transmittances were over 80%. However, the further particle size study showed that the obtained transmittance was acceptable.

The particle size, polydispersity index, and zeta potential significantly affected the NE behaviour. Moreover, the particle size also determines NE penetration ability, where sizes lower than 50 nm could penetrate deeply through the skin (Lala & Awari, 2014; Cai et al., 2016). The polydispersity index (PI) figures the degree of uniformity of the dispersed particles. A PI lower than 0.7 is preferred, as it indicates a narrow distribution of particles. PIs close to 1.0 potentially suggest Ostwald ripening, the phenomenon when smaller particles irreversibly merge with larger ones, leading to coalescence (Mason et al., 2006). Zeta potential illustrates the surface charge of particles, which forms the repulsion force between each globule. More positive or negative zeta potential hinders the integration of particles. The results of this study showed zeta potential higher than -20 mV, considered good. The negative charge of CrcNEs was probably due to the presence of glycols in both TW80 and TP and the existence of the VCO's anionic groups (Laxmi et al., 2015).

The freeze-thaw stability of CrcNEGs indicated no signs of an unstable formulation. The phase separation study result illustrates the endurance of CrcNEGs against temperature changes. The pH of CrcNEGs through six cycles indicated its suitability to be applied on the skin surface since the pH(s) were in the normal range of the skin pH. The obtained viscosity and spreadability values showed that CrcNEGs could be easily applied to the skin (Ueda *et al.,* 2010).

In the *ex vivo* permeation study, the presence of TW80 aided the drug penetration through the skin membrane because TW80 plays the role of a penetration enhancer, extracting the stratum corneum lipids and subsequently plunging the stratum corneum barrier ability (Khurana *et al.*, 2013). Further study is needed to compare the penetration of CrcNEGs with Crc conventional gels so that the difference can be assessed.

## Conclusion

The development of CrcNEGs was successfully conducted, with good characteristics of NEs and a stable form of NEGs. Furthermore, NEGs had sufficient penetration ability. To sum up, CrcNEGs can be the novel effective delivery method of curcumin.

# **Conflict of interest**

There is no conflict of interest associated with the present study.

# References

Ahmad, J., Gautam, A., Komath, S., Bano, M., Garg, A., & Jain, K. (2019). Topical Nano-emulgel for Skin Disorders: Formulation Approach and Characterisation. *Recent Patents on Anti-Infective Drug Discovery*, **14**(1), 36–48. https://doi.org/10.2174/1574891X14666181129115213

Cai, X.J., Mesquida, P., & Jones, S.A. (2016). Investigating the ability of nanoparticle-loaded hydroxypropyl methylcellulose and xanthan gum gels to enhance drug penetration into the skin. *International Journal of Pharmaceutics*, **513**(1–2), 302–308. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpharm.2016.08.055

Candioti, L.V., De Zan, M.M., Cámara, M.S., & Goicoechea, H. C. (2014). Experimental design and multiple response optimisation. Using the desirability function in analytical methods development. *Talanta*, *124*, 123–138. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.talanta.2014.01.034

Donsì, F., Wang, Y., & Huang, Q. (2011). Freeze–thaw stability of lecithin and modified starch-based nanoemulsions. *Food Hydrocolloids*, **25**(5), 1327–1336. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2010.12.008

Duangjit, S., Mehr, L.M., Kumpugdee-Vollrath, M., & Ngawhirunpat, T. (2014). Role of Simplex Lattice Statistical Design in the Formulation and Optimisation of Microemulsions for Transdermal Delivery. *Biological and Pharmaceutical Bulletin*, **37**(12), 1948–1957. https://doi.org/10.1248/bpb.b14-00549 Effendy, I., & Maibach, H.I. (1995). Surfactants and experimental irritant contact dermatitis. *Contact Dermatitis*, **33**(4), 217–225. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0536.1995.tb00470.x

Hewlings, S.J., & Kalman, D.S. (2017). Curcumin: A Review of Its' Effects on Human Health. *Foods*, **6**(10), 92. https://doi.org/10.3390/foods6100092

Khurana, S., Jain, N.K., & Bedi, P.M.S. (2013). Nanoemulsion based gel for transdermal delivery of meloxicam: Physicochemical, mechanistic investigation. *Life Sciences*, **92**(6–7), 383–392. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lfs.2013.01.005

Kim, B.S., Won, M., Lee, K.M., & Kim, C.S. (2008). In vitro permeation studies of nanoemulsions containing ketoprofen as a model drug. *Drug Delivery*, **15**(7), 465–469. https://doi.org/10.1080/10717540802328599

Lala, R.R., & Awari, N.G. (2014). Nanoemulsion-based gel formulations of COX-2 inhibitors for enhanced efficacy in inflammatory conditions. *Applied Nanoscience*, **4**(2), 143–151. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13204-012-0177-6

Laxmi, M., Bhardwaj, A., Mehta, S., & Mehta, A. (2015). Development and characterisation of nanoemulsion as carrier for the enhancement of bioavailability of artemether. *Artificial Cells, Nanomedicine, and Biotechnology*, **43**(5), 334–344. https://doi.org/10.3109/21691401.2014.887018

Mason, T.G., Wilking, J.N., Meleson, K., Chang, C.B., & Graves, S. M. (2006). Nanoemulsions: Formation, structure, and physical properties. *Journal of Physics: Condensed Matter*, **18**(41), R635–R666. https://doi.org/10.1088/0953-8984/18/41/R01

Muhtadi, W.K., Novitasari, L., Danarti, R., & Martien, R. (2020). Development of polymeric nanoparticle gel prepared with the combination of ionic pre-gelation and polyelectrolyte complexation as a novel drug delivery of timolol maleate. *Drug Development and Industrial Pharmacy*, **46**(11), 1844–1852. https://doi.org/10.1080/03639045.2020.1821053

Muhtadi, W.K., Novitasari, L., Martien, R., & Danarti, R. (2019). Factorial design as the method in the optimisation of timolol maleate-loaded nanoparticle prepared by ionic gelation technique. *International Journal of Applied Pharmaceutics*, **11**(5), 66–70. https://doi.org/10.22159/ijap.2019v11i5.34435

Rachmawati, H., Budiputra, D.K., & Mauludin, R. (2015). Curcumin nanoemulsion for transdermal application: Formulation and evaluation. *Drug Development and*  Industrial Pharmacy, **41**(4), 560–566. https://doi.org/10.3109/03639045.2014.884127

Setyawan, E.I., Setyowati, E.P., Rohman, A., & Nugroho, A.K. (2018). Central composite design for optimising extraction of EGCG from green tea leaf (Camellia sinensis L.). *International Journal of Applied Pharmaceutics*, 211–216. https://doi.org/10.22159/ijap.2018v10i6.29245

Shafiq-un-Nabi, S., Shakeel, F., Talegaonkar, S., Ali, J., Baboota, S., Ahuja, A., Khar, R.K., & Ali, M. (2007). Formulation development and optimisation using nanoemulsion technique: A technical note. *AAPS PharmSciTech*, **8**(2), E12–E17. https://doi.org/10.1208/pt0802028

Shiyan, S., Hertiani, T., Martien, R., & Nugroho, A. K. (2018). Optimisation of a novel kinetic-assisted infundation of white tea (Camellia sinensis) using central composite design. *International Journal of Applied Pharmaceutics*, 259–267. https://doi.org/10.22159/ijap.2018v10i6.29654

Su, R., Fan, W., Yu, Q., Dong, X., Qi, J., Zhu, Q., Zhao, W., Wu, W., Chen, Z., Li, Y., & Lu, Y. (2017). Size-dependent penetration of nanoemulsions into epidermis and hair follicles: Implications for transdermal delivery and immunisation. *Oncotarget*, **8**(24), 38214–38226. https://doi.org/10.18632/oncotarget.17130

Syukri, Y., Martien, R., Lukitaningsih, E., & Nugroho, A. E. (2018). Novel Self-Nano Emulsifying Drug Delivery System (SNEDDS) of andrographolide isolated from Andrographis paniculata Nees: Characterisation, in-vitro and in-vivo assessment. *Journal of Drug Delivery Science and Technology*, **47**, 514–520. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jddst.2018.06.014

Tang, S. Y., Manickam, S., Wei, T. K., & Nashiru, B. (2012). Formulation development and optimisation of a novel Cremophore EL-based nanoemulsion using ultrasound cavitation. *Ultrasonics Sonochemistry*, **19**(2), 330–345. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ultsonch.2011.07.001

Tønnesen, H. H., & Karlsen, J. (1985). Studies on curcumin and curcuminoids. VI. Kinetics of curcumin degradation in aqueous solution. *Zeitschrift Fur Lebensmittel-Untersuchung Und -Forschung*, **180**(5), 402–404. https://doi.org/10.1007/bf01027775

Ueda, C. T., Shah, V. P., Derdzinski, K., Ewing, G., Flynn, G., Maibach, H., Marques, M., Rytting, H., Shaw, S., Thakker, K., & Yacobi, A. (2010). Topical and Transdermal Drug Products. Dissolution Technologies, **17**(4), 12–25. https://doi.org/10.14227/DT170410P12